

**Executive Committee and Governing Body – September 2021**

**Tees Valley CCG Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES) Report 2020/2021**

## **1. Purpose of the report**

To provide an overview of the Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES) report for Tees Valley CCG. The report also provides an update on the 2020/21 action plan for Tees Valley CCG and provides a common draft action plan that will be considered by all CCGs to progress in relation to the Workforce Race Equality Standard and moving towards the development of the Integrated Care Board.

## **2. Background**

CCGs are required to participate in the national WRES data return. The main purpose of the WRES as outlined by NHS England is to:

- help local, and national, NHS organisations (and other organisations providing NHS services) to review their data against the nine WRES indicators
- produce action plans to close the gaps in workplace experience between white and Black and Ethnic Minority (BME) staff, and,
- improve BME representation at the Board level of the organisation

The nine indicators cover recruitment and pay; access to training; disciplinary; discrimination, bullying and harassment and Governing Body membership.

## **3. Progress against the WRES**

Following last year's WRES report, the areas of focus for the CCG were around bullying and harassment, health and wellbeing, overhauling recruitment processes and understanding our local communities. Progress was made on a variety of these themes through hosting a number of related topics at staff events and within training modules for managers (bullying & harassment; unconscious bias), providing support sessions for staff and managers so that staff's health and wellbeing conversations are constructive; reviewing induction processes, and also identifying how to better use community data utilising the NHS Employers 'measuring up tool' and identifying an EDI board champion. Some of the broader work relating to recruitment practices also form part of the People Plan actions and are part of a wider programme of work

across the system; a pilot has been carried out with some provider colleagues, the results of which will feed into future work.

Further updates are outlined in the 2020/21 WRES Action plan in Appendix 1.

#### **4. 2021 WRES Data**

This report reflects the Tees Valley CCG WRES data submitted for the 2020/21 Workforce Race Equality Standard return (April 1<sup>st</sup> 2020 – March 31<sup>st</sup> 2021).

Table 1: Overall workforce by ethnicity – as of 31.03.21

	Tees Valley CCG	%
White	83	87.4%
BAME	9	9.5%
Ethnicity Unknown/Not Stated	3	3.2%

The CCG workforce is predominantly comprised of staff that are 'white' with 9.5% of staff identifying as BAME.

##### **a. Indicator 1 - CCG Staff numbers by Agenda for Change and Very Senior Manager (VSM) banding and ethnicity**

(table on next page)

AFC Banding	White (non clinical)	BAME	Undisclosed	Comments
Band 2	1	0	0	
Band 3	6	0	1	
Band 4	7	0	0	
Band 5	3	0	0	
Band 6	4	0	0	
Band 7	2	0	0	
Band 8A	13	0	0	
Band 8B	7	0	0	
Band 8C	1	0	0	
Band 8D	1	0	0	
Band 9	5	0	1	3 non clinical, 2 clinical
VSM	2	0	0	
'Other'	31	9	1	Lay members are included within this category as there is no "other" non-clinical category.

Bands 1-9 – staff are paid using the national Agenda for Change (AfC) pay scales for these grades. (Where local pay scales are in use, then for non-medical staff, the equivalent basic salary level may be used Medical and Dental subgroups – staff paid using the Medical and Dental pay scales. Subgroups are identified by using the grade codes as recorded in the Electronic Staff Record Warehouse.)

“Very Senior Managers (VSM)” are defined as exclusively including:

- Chief executives
- Executive directors, with the exception of those who are eligible to be on the consultant contract by virtue of their qualification and the requirements of the post
- Other senior managers with board level responsibility who report directly to the chief executive. “The overall workforce” refers to: all directly employed staff. Organisations should either include all bank and locum staff, students on placement and staff employed by contractors or not include them altogether – as long as the approach is consistent over time.

**b. Indicator 2 - Relative likelihood of staff being appointed from shortlisting across all posts**

Table 2: Likelihood of being appointed from shortlisting in period 1 April 2020-31 March 2021

CCG	Number of Shortlisted Applicants			Number appointed from shortlisting		Relative likelihood of appointment from shortlisting			
	White	BME	Unknown	White	BME	Unknown	White	BME	Unknown
Tees Valley	39	3	1	5	0	0	12.82%	0	0

The table above reflects that, the relative likelihood of appointment from shortlisting for white staff was 12.82%. Numbers of BME applicants overall were small and no BAME applicants were shortlisted.

This data is extracted from NHS Jobs and relates to the ethnicity of people shortlisted and offered CCG posts regardless of whether candidates accepted the role. For example there may have been more offers made than actual number of posts recruited to if some candidates declined the offer.

**c. Indicator 3 - Relative Likelihood of staff entering the formal disciplinary process**

During 2020/21 no CCG employees had been recorded as entering the formal disciplinary process.

**d. Indicator 4 - Relative Likelihood of staff accessing non-mandatory training and CPD**

Data reflecting access to non-mandatory training by ethnicity was not routinely collected.

The recent roll out of ESR self-service within the CCG now allows staff to record non-mandatory training on the electronic system.

**e. Indicators 5-8 from the annual NHS staff survey**

Although not required for the data submission to NHS digital on 31 August, the WRES reporting guidance encourages the review of the following questions from the national staff survey.

Table 3: Staff Survey Results

<b>Staff Survey Questions</b>	<b>Tees Valley CCG</b>
<b>Indicator 5</b> Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from patients, relatives or the public in last 12 months.	7%
<b>Indicator 6</b> Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from colleagues in last 12 months.	9%
<b>Indicator 7</b> Percentage believing that the organisation provides equal opportunities for career progression or promotion.	100%
<b>Indicator 8</b> In the last 12 months have you personally experienced discrimination at work from any of the following? Manager/team leader or other colleagues.	2%

The survey results could not be broken down by ethnicity due to the data being identifiable.

A small percentage of staff reported experiencing bullying and harassment.

All staff appeared to consider there being equal opportunities for career progression or promotion, which was an excellent response.

The National Staff Survey Summary for Tees Valley CCG can be found here:  
<https://cms.nhsstaffsurveys.com/app/reports/2020/16C-summary-2020.pdf>

**f. Indicator 9 - Percentage difference between the organisation's Board Membership by ethnicity disaggregated by voting membership of the Board and by executive membership of the Board.**

The WRES return asks CCGs to state the ethnicity of the Board (Governing Body) and to also share details of the ethnicity of executive members.

WRES defines Executive Board members as employees of the organisation that are voting members and who advise organisational management on specific operations, e.g. Medical Director or Finance Director.

Table 4: Board membership by ethnicity

2020/21	White	BME	Ethnicity Unknown/ not stated
<b>Total Board Members</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>% by Ethnicity</b>	<b>93.3%</b>	<b>6.7%</b>	<b>0%</b>
<b>Overall Workforce</b>	<b>87.4%</b>	<b>9.5%</b>	<b>3.2</b>
<b>Difference (Board representation in comparison to overall workforce)</b>	<b>6.0%</b>	<b>-2.8%</b>	<b>-3.2%</b>

Board membership for Tees Valley CCG is under representative in comparison to the overall workforce due to the % difference in the headcount for BME ethnicity (-2.8% difference). The results show that the majority of Governing Body members were white; all board members have disclosed their ethnicity.

## 5. CCG WRES Action Plan 2021-2022

An action plan has been developed for Tees Valley CCG to enhance data collection and monitoring for future data returns and to enable the CCG to take action to improve in-year and can be found in Appendix 2.

This action plan will apply to all CCGs supported by NECS, as it has been developed in anticipation of the new ICS structure.

It is important to note that the action plan responds directly to matters highlighted by the Workforce Race Equality Standard, and more comprehensive actions with regards to equality, diversity and inclusion will be progressed through the implementation of the NHS People Plan and Equality Objectives.

In addition, the CCG's Head of Governance has been asked to join the regional EDI Steering Group and this will prove to be beneficial in sharing good practice and contributing to wider system working.

## 6. Recommendations

The Governing Body is asked to:

- Note the summary of the WRES data submitted to NHS Digital on 27<sup>th</sup> August 2021 on behalf of Tees Valley CCG (appendix 3).

- Consider the implications of the report for Tees Valley CCG along with proposed actions reflected in the WRES action plan.
- Approve the WRES Report for publication on the CCG's website

**Hannah Brooks**

**NECS Senior Governance Manager – Equality, Diversity and Inclusion**

**09.09.21**

**Appendix 1 – Tees Valley CCG WRES Action Plan 2020/21 - Updates**

**Tees Valley CCG WRES Action Plan 2020/21**

Learning from WRES	Linked WRES indicator	Action	Director Lead	Lead	Deadline
<p>The workforce could better reflect the communities served by the CCG, particularly in non-clinical roles.</p>	<p><b>Indicator 1</b> – CCG Staff numbers by Agenda for Change and VSM banding and ethnicity</p>	<p>Implementation of the actions contained within the NHS People Plan will support the CCG to be inclusive, specifically:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Discuss equality, diversity and inclusion as part of employee health and wellbeing conversations <b>Complete.</b> - added to individual risk assessment as part of return to office</li> <li>• All new starters to have a health and wellbeing induction. <b>Complete - Included as part of the induction checklist.</b></li> </ul> <p>Overhaul recruitment and promotion practices to make sure that staffing reflects the diversity of the community, and regional and national labour markets including considering diversity targets.</p> <p><b>Ongoing - Outcome of Trust pilot findings from the NHSEI overhauling recruitment pilot were shared w/c 06</b></p>	<p>Director of Strategic Development</p>	<p>(revised to Head of Governance working with Head of Corporate Services)</p>	<p>From 01.09.20</p> <p>From 01.10.20</p> <p>31.10.20</p> <p>31.10.20</p> <p>30.11.20</p>

Learning from WRES	Linked WRES indicator	Action	Director Lead	Lead	Deadline
		<p>September 2021 and can be found in appendix 4</p> <p>These findings will now form the development of an Overhauling recruitment action plan as part of the People Plan action.</p> <p>Understand the profile of our North of England Commissioning Support workforce and identify opportunities to collaborate on recruitment and share good practice – Partially complete. Some data on the CCG's demographics has been collated by utilising NHS Employers 'Measuring up' tool. This needs further refinement and will be used to produce the '100 Village by protected characteristic infographic'</p> <p>Identify a Governing Body lead to champion equality, diversity and inclusion within the CCG. Complete. Caroline Gitsham assigned as champion.</p>			
Small number of BME applicants for CCG roles	<b>Indicator 2</b> Relative likelihood of staff being appointed from shortlisting across all posts (internal and external recruitment activity) broken down by ethnicity	Work with local authorities, the Tees Valley Combined Authority and local partners such as the Department of Work and Pensions in developing plans for recruitment that contribute to the regeneration of communities, especially in light of the economic impact of Covid. This work can also include ensuring the	Director of Strategic Development	(revised to Head of Governance for local actions, however, ICS-wide actions will be a large part of the progression of this action)	31.03.21

Learning from WRES	Linked WRES indicator	Action	Director Lead	Lead	Deadline
		<p>workforce is more reflective of communities the CCG serves.</p> <p>Identify opportunities to contribute to and support local NHS widening participation recruitment programmes and work with organisations such as local Further Education Colleges</p> <p>Utilise local networks such voluntary sector development agencies to promote CCG job opportunities.</p> <p>Identify good practice from approaches utilised by local authorities with regards to recruitment and representation.</p> <p>Partially achieved - the CCG has explored advertising on additional platforms to widen recruitment including the use of social media and circulation to VCSE colleagues. The action has been superseded by a regional HR piece of work looking to review recruitment and promotion practices to make sure it supports the requirement that our workforce reflects the diversity of our communities.</p> <p>This action will be carried over to the 2021 WRES action plan as part of the overhauling recruitment action, working closely with the ICS EDI Leads and EDI Steering group to continue to share best practice.</p>			<p>31.10.20</p> <p>31.03.21</p> <p>30.11.20</p>

Learning from WRES	Linked WRES indicator	Action	Director Lead	Lead	Deadline
CCG does not have a system for monitoring access to non-mandatory training	<b>Indicator 4</b> Relative likelihood of staff accessing non-mandatory training and CPD	Develop and implement system to track and report on access to non-mandatory training. <b>Complete – ESR offers this functionality, guidance issued to staff via staff briefing. This will continue to be promoted to staff in order to capture training.</b>	Director of Strategic Development	CCG HR Business Partner – NECS  Revised to Head of Governance working with Head of Corporate Services  CCG HR and Payroll Link	31.12.20
Some staff have experienced bullying and harassment; and some staff feel there is not equal opportunity for career progression.	<b>Indicators 5-8</b> Staff survey questions focusing on carer progression, discrimination and bullying and harassment.	Include discussions re. bullying, harassment and equity in career progression in wellbeing conversations as part of the People Plan implementation work programme. Review the outcomes of the North East Leadership Academy ‘listening’ work commissioned by predecessor CCGs with regards to bullying. <b>Complete focused staff events around bullying and harassment – staff event, values work, roll out of HR manager training in September 2021, included in strategic briefings</b>  Monitoring and reporting on access to non-mandatory training (see action in relation to Indicator 4). <b>Complete – ESR offers this functionality, guidance issued</b>	Director of Strategic Development	Partnership & Health Inequalities Manager  Revised to Head of Governance working with Head of Corporate Services	From 01.09.20  30.09.20  31.12.20

Learning from WRES	Linked WRES indicator	Action	Director Lead	Lead	Deadline
		to staff via staff briefing. To continue to promote			
There are small numbers of BME Governing Body members.	<p><b>Indicator 9</b> Percentage difference between the organisations' Board Membership by ethnicity disaggregated:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• By voting membership of the Board</li> <li>• By executive membership of the Board</li> </ul>	<p>Review the make-up of the new Tees Valley CCG Governing Body, and identify opportunities when recruiting to attract applications from candidates from BME communities.</p> <p>This action will be carried over to the 2021 WRES action plan as part of the Model Employer People Plan action, working closely with the ICS EDI Leads and EDI Steering group to collate data regionally to feed into the proposed ICS structure.</p>	Director of Strategic Development	Revised – this will form part of the ICS development work as we progress towards the formation of the Integrated Care Board.	31.10.20

**Appendix 2– Proposed 2020/21 WRES Action Plan – All CCGs**

WRES ACTION No.	WRES Indicat or No.	Area of Focus	Action	Owner	Complete by	RAG	Updates
1	1 & 9	DATA CLEANSE	Utilise 1-1s and appraisals to encourage staff to update personal data in ESR.	CCG Leads	31/03/22	Planned activity	
2	2	MORE INCLUSIVE RECRUITMENT PROCESSES/REPRESENTATIVE WORKFORCE	Review external adverts to better understand how they can be more accessible to BAME colleagues.	NECS HR	31/03/22	Planned activity	
3	2	MORE INCLUSIVE RECRUITMENT PROCESSES/PEOPLE PLAN ACTION	Review recruitment and promotion practices to make sure it supports the requirement that our workforce reflects the diversity of our communities. <i>(This may include creating accountability for outcomes, agreeing diversity targets, and addressing bias in systems and processes - linked to people plan objective).</i>	Kay Fletcher-McVey- NECS HR/ EDI LEAD - Hannah Brooks	31/11/2021	Planned activity	
4	4	DATA CAPTURE - NON MAND TRAINING	Review non mandatory training data capture processes for CCGs	NECS EDI LEAD/CCG LINKS	31/03/2022	Planned activity	

WRES ACTION No.	WRES Indicat or No.	Area of Focus	Action	Owner	Complete by	RAG	Updates
5	4	TRAINING COACHING AND CAREER PROGRESSION	Promote Coaching and mentoring programmes- Encourage staff to apply for a Leadership Academy ILM 5 Coaching programme which has been specifically allocated to those from BAME backgrounds. Integrate the Reciprocal Mentoring for Inclusion Programme.	Hannah Brooks - EDI LEAD/NECS HR	31/03/22	Planned activity	<a href="https://www.leadershipacademy.nhs.uk/programmes/reciprocal-mentoring-for-inclusion-programme/">https://www.leadershipacademy.nhs.uk/programmes/reciprocal-mentoring-for-inclusion-programme/</a>
6	5&6	REDUCING BULLYING AND HARRASSMENT	Continue to enforce a zero-tolerance policy against bullying and harassment in the workplace.	Hannah Brooks - EDI LEAD/NECS HR/CCG Leads	31/03/22	Planned activity	
7	5&6	REDUCING BULLYING AND HARRASSMENT	Improve staff survey completion rates and take up from CCGs, continuing to record and monitor staff survey results to feed into future WRES reporting.	Comms teams/NECS HR	31/03/22	Planned activity	

WRES ACTION No.	WRES Indicat or No.	Area of Focus	Action	Owner	Complete by	RAG	Updates
8	7&8	PROMOTE CULTURE OF INCLUSION	Develop and communicate opportunities for CCG staff to feed into appropriate staff networks. Utilising EDI ICS staff network groups as appropriate. Staff members to empower people to reflect on their lived experience, support them to become better informed on the issues, and determine what they and their teams can do to make further progress.	CCG Leads/ Hannah Brooks-NECS EDI LEAD	30/11/2021	Planned activity	
9	9	WELL-LED ORGANISATION - SENIOR MANAGEMENT/BOARD MEMBERSHIP	Publish progress against the 'Model Employer' goals. Analyse board representation regionally working closely with the ICS EDI Leads and EDI Steering group to collate data to feed into the proposed ICS structure.	CCG Leads/ Hannah Brooks-NECS EDI LEAD	31/03/22	Planned activity	